

The concern about environmental responsibility in Public Service Media management

Tania Fernández Lombao

Professor of Communication Science from the University of Santiago de Compostela

Andrea Valencia-Bermúdez

Researcher at the International Network of Communication Management from the University of Santiago de Compostela.

Francisco Campos Freire

Professor of Journalism at the Faculty of Communication from the University of Santiago de Compostela and Prometeo of the SENESCYT in the Particular Technical University of Loja and the Pontifical Catholic of Ibarra (Ecuador).

Abstract

Corporate Social Responsibility is the commitment to ethical and moral principles and good corporate practices. Indeed, it has become an improved management tool of private and public organizations in the last 50 years. Social, environmental, ethical responsibilities are social demands to which public and private companies should respond with the same priority and sensibility. The environmental issue is not the less important, as it has been evidence at the Paris Summit (2015) on climate change (COP21). The environmental commitment and responsibility is at the epicentre of management, since it belongs to the major challenge of modern-day humanity. Verifying that commitment –which is the proposal of this paper, related to public broadcasters- is checking how those organizations are fulfilling the objectives of the third millennium.

Keywords: CSR, environment, environmental responsibility, public broadcasters, public media.

1. Introduction

The increasing popularity of Corporate Social Responsibility is more a symptom of necessity than a diagnosis of objectives achieved. Undoubtedly, the two concepts are part of the PSM's management agenda, since that is also a concern of societies in which audiovisual corporations –both public and private- are working. In the case of public companies this is even more important, since to those internal exigencies are added the triple estimation of intrinsic, exchange, and use value (EBU, 2015). That double responsibility –social and environmental- compromise providers of public audiovisual services, since it offers them a new tool for re-legitimation of their remit and economic sustainability behind their publics and stakeholders.

Until just a decade ago, CSR –as a self-regulatory system- was only conceived as a strategy and management tool for private organizations, but not suitable for public institutions, because it had been assumed that the regulatory framework of public service media covered all their responsibilities. That conception has become, however, obsolete, since the institutional regulatory framework is too limited and failing to address technological challenges on time.

That is why many companies started to integrate hetero-regulation frameworks, assuming social and environmental responsibilities as a voluntary interaction strategy of interaction with stakeholders, of social legitimation and reputation improvement.

Despite the popularity and advances in the integration of social and environmental responsibility in companies' management agendas, there is yet not unanimity on the definition and scope of both concepts. Neither is there full consistency between the assumption of their moral philosophy and the effectiveness of their implementation in all organizations.

When switching from theory to practice, some organizations are only pursuing reputation through social marketing, and others through CSR management, as a sequence of bureaucratic processes more dominated by evidences' verification than by the social significance of their actions. The development of CSR could be divided into three historical periods: first one, the assumption of that social commitment; second one, the implementation, systematization and verification; and third one, the significance of its social impact.

The evolving concepts of sustainability and social responsibility may be explained in terms of their historical trajectory. Sustainability is the satisfaction of needs of current generations without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs (Bruntland Commission, 1987). According to Clarke (2014), it is important to distinguish between sustainable growth, sustainable use, and sustainable development. The first one is contradictory, since there cannot exist indefinite growth. The second concept can be applied only to renewable resources. And the third one is used to indicate the improvement of human's quality of life within the limits of ecosystems' capacity (IUCN, PNUMA, WWF 1991). Sustainability converges with social responsibility since its overall performance within the organization includes policies, decisions, and actions to achieve economic, environmental and social outcomes (AccountAbility, 2005).

As regards the European Commission (2001, 2009), CSR refers to "companies voluntarily going beyond what the law requires to achieve social and environmental objectives during the course of their daily business activities. For the World Business Council for Sustainable Development (2002, 2011), CSR is the commitment by business to behave ethically and contribute to economic development while improving the quality of life of the workforce, the families, and the local community and society at large.

Corporate Social Responsibility encompasses "not only what companies do with their profits, but also how they make them. It goes beyond philanthropy and compliance, and addresses how companies manage their economic, social, and environmental impacts, as well as their relationships in all key spheres of influence" (Kennedy School of Government Corporate Responsibility Initiative, 2004). It is also presented from a business approach, including opened and transparent practices, ethical behaviour, respect to stakeholders and commitment in the contribution of economic, social, and environmental value (SustainAbility, 2011).

The global financial crisis in 2008 highlighted a need to restore ethical and integral values of governance, in order to enhance companies' credibility. What has become evident in this crisis is the lack of regulation, ethics, solidarity, moral principles, and accountability within a complex scenario with structural economic and social problems. The concept of governance (Moore, 1995; Muñoz, Prats, 2003; Galés, 2007; Olsen, 2008), as a multi-level management system designed to respond to complexity, an open-government model for society and stakeholders, not only focused on internal and immediate profitability, but also on external medium and long-term utility. This approach is the one that fits with the commitment and current practice of Corporate Social Responsibility.

The corporate response to society's general concerns is part of what some refer to as the third generation of corporate codes of ethics (Stohl, Stohl and Popova, 2009), considering that it was first the consistency

of ethics with business, and then its responsibility against stakeholders. Now these renewed postulates propose -in response to the perception that ethics has been removed from the collective agenda, being the global crisis one of the consequences-, joining economy and society back together to generate shared social value (Porter and Kramer, 2011).

The commitment to ethics and corporate social responsibility should not be understood as an imposition or an administrative procedure, but as potential guiding and driver of company's internal and external values (Solomon, 1992). This clarification is important since this double interpretation is highlighted in some organizations. That kind of actions are not performed because they are understood as a requirement that can overextend the possibilities of management; and, also, they are seen as bureaucratic actions based only on the achievement of indicators' report for the use of their public relations policies. Both attitudes are wrong and have an impact on management's moral responsibility, which occurs when ethical expectations are violated, compromising business value (Clarke, 2014).

Public service broadcasting is under threat across Europe, while the awareness of its contribution to democratic, social, cultural, and an identity values still remain. The traditional model of public 20th century-broadcasters faces the challenge of readapting itself as a new public audiovisual service, which is still necessary in the digital era. Undoubtedly, its particular challenges are reforming its governance systems and the sustainability of its funding models; satisfying the requirements of accountability; adapting to the digital ecosystem; fostering creativity and innovation; and improving quality of contents, pluralism, diversity and contribution to democratic values.

Social and environmental responsibilities are included in these new governance practices. They explicitly assume the commitment to social and environmental responsibility, although its management does not go much beyond standard practices of accountability. Analysis of reports and websites show that there are formal policies, but there is a lack -except in some rare cases- of innovative proposals, which would help them to convert those actions in reputation and social impact improvements of those organizations.

2. Methodology

The research aims at observing how the environment becomes increasingly relevant in CSR policies implemented by European public service media. For that purpose, only corporations with CSR reports are analysed (BBC, RTE, ORF, YLE, ZDF, RTP, RTVE, FTV, and RTBF). The study is divided into two different parts. Firstly, it is carried out a content analysis of the last Corporate Social Responsibility statements, which are available on their websites: BBC Corporate Social Responsibility Performance Review 2013, from the BBC -United Kingdom-; Corporate Responsibility 2009, from RTÉ -Ireland-; Nachhaltigkeit Im ORF 2011, from ORF -Austria-; Vastuurapotti 2012, from YLE -Finland-; Mit Perspektive für alle. Gesellschaftliches Engagement und unternehmerische Verantwortung des ZDF 2011-2012, from ZDF -Germany-; Relatório de Sustentabilidade 2012, from RTP -Portugal-; Informe del Pacto Mundial 2013, from RTVE -Spain-; Rapport Annuel 2012, from FT -France-; and Rapport Annuel 2013 from RTBF -Belgium-. Secondly, it is conducted an observation of the environmental treatment on websites of the above-mentioned public broadcasters.

The analysed items are those proposed by the Sustainability Reporting Guidelines (Global Reporting Initiative), which establish environmental indicators with a media sector supplement. This paper recommends reporting on: use of paper and water, impact of inks and printing materials, recycling policies, greenhouse gas emissions and measures to be environmentally sound.

This international initiative has made its guides the most widely implemented by companies around the world when reporting on corporate performance. In 2013, it published the G4 guidelines for sustainability reporting, although it has not yet made available any specific complement for media companies. For that reason, it is decided to use the criteria proposed in the GRI Media Sector Supplement. On the other hand, it is determined whether public broadcasters report on environmental policies in their websites. To this end, it will be taken contents displayed as a part of a crosscutting strategy instead of specific actions related to this topic.

3. Environmental performance of CSR reports of public service media in Europe

The first part of this research, based on the content analysis of the last CSR reports of the nine above-mentioned broadcasters, allow us to identify areas to which they pay the most attention. Symbols “√” and “X” in Table 1 indicate whether or not the organization develop environmental responsibility actions into that category.

Table 1. Indicators of environmental performance in Public Service Media in Europe

INDICATOR OF ENVIRONMENTAL PERFORMANCE									
ENVIRONMENTAL PERFORMANCE	BBC	RTÉ	ORF	YLE	RTP	ZDF	RTVE	FT	RTBF
Use of paper	X	X	√	X	√	√	X	X	X
Use of water	√	X	X	X	√	√	X	X	X
Impact of ink and printing materials	X	X	X	X	X	X	√	X	X
Recycling policies	√	√	√	√	√	√	X	X	X
Greenhouse gas emissions	√	√	X	√	√	√	√	X	√
Measures to be environmentally sound	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	√	√

Source: Prepared by the authors, 2016

3.1 Use of paper

Four of the analysed organizations have developed actions in this field. The Austrian ORF, engaged in a process of digitization, reduced the use of paper from 180,98 tonnes in 2009 to 173,08 in 2011. On the other hand, the German ZDF recycled 20,3 tonnes of paper between 2011 and 2012, while the French FT also diminish the use of paper and the printer replacement, but it does not provide specific data.

The Portuguese RTP employed 27,6 tonnes of paper in 2013 –a three per cent less than the previous year-, even though every worker uses more sheets –eight- as a result of staff reductions. To counter-balance these negative effects, the use of recycled paper was increased by four per cent.

3.2. Use of water

Regarding the use of water, the English BBC reduced by seven per cent its expenditure during the period from 2012 to 2013. The ZDF used less water in 2012 -4,4 million litres-, but figures are not specified. The RTP spent 27 per cent less than in 2012, intending to continue along these lines with the installation of water savers in the taps.

3.3. Impact of ink and printing materials

The Spanish RTVE –through its SCR memory- is the only organization that provides information on this matter, since it makes available its project of printers’ optimization, on which 389 out of 2,099 units were removed in 2012.

3.4. Recycling policies

Five organizations provide information on their policies in this field through their SCR memories. The BBC points the improvement of recycling ratios -81 per cent in 2012-2013-. Furthermore, the RTÉ recycled 68 per cent of its waste in 2008, and the RTP supports resources management, but no figures are supplied.

The Austrian ORF opts for economic efficiency and has acquired long-living technological products that, even so, require more alternating current and air-conditioning. Also, the ORF takes into account the availability of replacement pieces in all its purchases. The organization indicates an increase in non-recyclable waste from 132.74 tonnes in 2009 to 168.6 in 2011. Meanwhile, the ZDF cleaned up hard drives of equipment -based on the ISO 900I- revising an annual average of 500 computers and 120 laptops.

3.5. Greenhouse gas emissions

All analysed corporations include information on greenhouse gas emissions in their memories, with the exception of Austria, Finland and France. The BBC shows its commitment through control measurements with the “Albert” system, for the sustainability in television production. On the figures, it points a four per cent reduction in energy consumption and a six per cent reduction in CO2 emissions during the period 2012-2013. In Ireland, the RTÉ indicated a 19 per cent decrease in the use of natural gas and an 11 per cent decline in power consumption during 2008.

The SCR report of RTP details the different types of emissions and their corresponding quantities. In this regard, RTP points out that greenhouse gas emissions were reduced by 17 per cent in 2013. Also, the memory proposes to continue the same trend, reducing the number of journeys and the fleet of vehicles. The ZDF reduced power consumption to 902,289 kilowatt-hour and lowered CO2 emissions to 24 tonnes a year. The organization bets on electric vehicles and proves that the entire fleet complies with the Euro 5 emissions standard.

The only measure presented by the Spanish RTVE is the installation of low energy air-conditioning devices. In Belgium, the RTBF notes the contract of green electricity supply and the pilot implementation of compressed natural gas vehicles.

3.6. Measures to be environmentally sound

Most of the data displayed in SCR memories is related to this topic, since its generic title allows the inclusion of all kind of environmentally friendly measures.

With a view of minimising the impact in environmental terms, the BBC moved its headquarters to a new sustainable place and replaced physical travel with videoconferencing. In 2008, the Irish public broadcasters joined the program “A little step”, developed by the Transport Office in Dublin to encourage staff walking to work. Also, the RTÉ joined a programme to promote the use of bicycles by its staff, with financial assistance to cover the cost of these vehicles. Furthermore, it abolished the use of polystyrene.

The ORF optimized hours of air-conditioning use, gradually replaced lamps, reduced air and water in cooling systems, and installed solar panels in its headquarters, which allowed it to save up to 20 per cent. The RTP reduced by seven per cent power consumption and 12 per cent fuel consumption.

The German ZDF is the most active corporation on environmental measures. In its last SCR report, it notes the replacement of obsolete components and devices; the launching of the Ecoprofit project for the optimized use of resources; the development of an environmental guide; the installation of solar cells on the headquarters' roof; the assembly of a new cooling system, which represents a saving of 25,000 million a year; the use of train whenever possible; and the use of LED lights and certified timber. The result of these measures has been the saving of 120,000 euros and the yearly 1.3 per cent reduction in energy consumption. Also, the ZDF adds that 19 per cent of purchases are 100 per cent certified organic.

As regards the fleet, ZDF reports that vehicles should comply with Euro 5 emissions standard, establishing limits to fuel consumption and CO₂ emissions. The corporation promotes electric mobility within the company. In fact, it has bought a new sustainable vehicle in 2014 with an efficiency of 90 per cent. Also, they call for the use of green cleaning products.

In the same vein, the Spanish RTVE installed long life lamps in its headquarters; demolished asbestos-affected installations; procured more sustainable technologies and tools; installed more efficient energy –with inverter systems- and launched the Corporate Videoconference Service, with the objective of reducing personnel movement –in 2012, 613 meetings were convened by videoconferencing-.

The French FT reports on the implementation of the following environmental measures: use of environmentally friendly furniture; employment of natural detergents and low-energy LED lights; remodelling of meeting rooms equipped with videoconference technologies; long-term purchases and promotion of the Ecoprod Collective to promote responsible film productions.

The Belgian RTBF supports the use of electric bikes in the organization's buildings and the acquisition of long-term office equipment. Also, it created ten *ecogroups* to come up with new environmental solutions. The Finnish YLE distinguished five elements in this area: reducing company premises by 40 per cent; applying environmental criteria for vehicle purchase and travel policies; reducing flights; encouraging videoconferences and the use of public transport; and following the recommendations of the WWF Green Office in environmental matters.

4. Environmental responsibility in websites of European Public Service Media

The analysis of corporate PSM's websites shows three distinct realities: 1) BBC from the UK, FT from France, and YLE from Finland include fixed areas for environmental responsibility; 2) RTÉ from Ireland and RTP from Portugal only publish reports on that issue ("The Green broadcaster" and "Relatorios de Sustentabilidade", respectively); 3) RTVE from Spain, ZDF from Germany, RTBF from Belgium, and ORF from Austria do not have a section on environmental responsibility. While environmental responsibility is still in the process of becoming a management's priority, below is a description of the main characteristics of the four pioneer broadcasters.

The British BBC highlights three main approaches to sustainability: 1) Drive innovation in their core business in order to lead the broadcasting industry in sustainable production; 2) Continually work to reduce the impacts of our operations, through targets which address their environmental footprint and save the BBC money; 3) Inspire their staff to exemplify sustainable behaviour in all that they do.

The BBC approach to environmental responsibility is called “The Difference”, including five defined areas: 1) get the basics right, reducing the impacts of the infrastructure they provide and operate, for example by investing in energy efficiency for their buildings and technology; 2) improve the way of working by reducing travel, by increasing video conference, and by using bespoke tools such as albert the carbon calculator for TV production to encourage good practice; 3) require suppliers to improve the sustainability of their products and services; 4) lead the industry, embedding sustainability in the TV production process; 5) engage their staff through training courses and awareness campaigns.

BBC’s sustainability team works with a group of external advisors, who they meet twice, annually to analyse the BBC’s progress and provide advice and guidance. In 2008 the Royal Charter set a framework of objectives for a period of eight years. Among environmental goals, they have targets to reduce energy consumption and CO2 emissions from buildings by 20 per cent; to reduce water use by 25 per cent per person; to recycle more of their waste by 70 per cent; and to tackle emissions from travel by 20 per cent. Also, the corporation is expected to reach 100 per cent of sustainable production.

The BBC also launched a carbon calculator called Albert, a tool that help productions measure their footprint, and to help the industry make the switch to more sustainable ways of working. Albert’s use is mandatory for BBC Television and CBeebies. From 2011 onwards, the BBC has formed a partnership with BAFTA, where it is made available for free.

Recently, the corporation has developed a complementary tool –Albert +-, which aims at helping production teams make their programmes in more sustainable ways, keeping track of their achievements, and rewarding them with an albert+ rating –One, Two, or Three stars, determined by the range and complexity of green initiatives implemented by each team. All working areas may be controlled by Albert+, from training and production offices, to travels and studies.

As regards the French FT, it declares that its immediate priority is to address climate change through three objectives: 1) reduce environmental footprints in operations; 2) reduce the environmental impact of their products; and 3) inform and make people aware of environmental responsibility.

As regards the first goal, it attaches the highest importance to the development of a greenhouse gas management system, using the carbon footprint method. This systems is organized into five main areas: a) building operation; b) green policies for ICT –Information and Communication Technologies-; c) vehicle fleet’s mobility and management; d) waste management; e) and responsible purchases. This goal is accompanied by internal communication’s strategies with two key messages: climate change is a global problem that has to be mitigated, and actions for reducing carbon footprint has to be carried out at all levels.

France Télévisions is one of the largest TV-content producers in France and, consequently, it assesses the environmental impact of their products and tries to gradually reduce it. The CSR department entered into an opened dialogue with production managers, technicians, and all departments for encouraging them to adopt environmental-friendly approaches.

In this regard, FT is one of the founding members of Ecoprod, which in 2009 established a resource centre for audiovisual professionals in order to reduce the ecological footprint on their production processes. That initiative created the Carbon’Clap, the first carbon-footprint calculator for audiovisual productions, which may be an analogous to the above-mentioned Albert. Also, a practical guide on how to make eco-productions and to create a charter for audiovisual companies complemented the tool.

For activities related to the third objective, the FT stresses the need for reporting on environmental problems, climate change and energy measures. The aim is to provide different publics with the keys for understanding the main social problems; for example, the launching of opening dialogues with staff, NGOs, and public at large. Also, FT lets publicly know its commitment in 2008 to the Charter of Sustainable Development for Public Establishments and Companies, with the objective of promoting and proposing future advanced solutions for sustainable broadcasters.

Furthermore, the French broadcaster launched in 2014 a carbon strategy in order to gradually reduce it. Within the Horizon 2020, FT is aimed at reducing greenhouse gas emissions by 8 per cent with respect to the data in 2011. This global objective is applied to buildings, mobility, resource management, waste management, green ICTs, and sustainable purchases.

The Finnish YLE launched its environmental policy in 2009, when it established a programme for the promotion of environmentally friendly practices, including the improvement of natural resource efficiency and the recycling of used materials.

In the period 2014-2016, YLE updated its objectives both in terms of environmental footprint and cost savings. On the one hand, it reduced its real estate holdings and started to make more efficient use of facilities in Tampere and Pasila. Also, it modified its travel policy, reducing national flights, increasing videoconference meetings, giving priority to public transport and encouraging teleworking.

As regards energy, the web states that the consumption of electricity was reduced in 2014. Moreover, it was installed LED lighting, both outdoors and indoors. Electricity consumption in 2007 was 34.6 million kilowatts, while in 2013 did not reach 30 million. Also, the cooling system was improved and the water use was reduced 13 per cent in 2014, compared with the previous year.

Traffic is another working area included in the YLE's environmental strategy. In 2014, the fleet had 275 vehicles, 30 of which were hybrids or low-fuel consumption. The objective is to continue the renovation of low-emissions cars until reaching further to about a fifth of fleet. Additionally, YLE provides its staff with electric bicycles for short distances. When it comes to recycling, YLE promotes the product separation and recovery in their facilities. In 2014, it produced about 560 thousand kilos of waste, being 7.3 per cent mixed. The goal is to maintain the percentage below 10 per cent. YLE also recycles furniture, appliance, and office supplies. According to data published, the recycling percentage today is 92.7 per cent and continues to grow. From the management point-of-view, YLE created an Environment Committee to monitor strategies where members meet from two to four times a year.

5. The case of Spanish local corporations

Spain has a unique model of public service media. It is divided into two main groups: the state corporation (RTVE) and 12 regional organizations, framed within territories known as Autonomous Regions. As regards these 12 audiovisual services, 5 of them are developing CSR actions, while there are significant differences in approaches and objectives.

Galicia, Catalonia and the Basque country launched crosscutting strategies including the main elements of CSR: environment, human resources, local communities, staff, audiences, and management. However, responsibility strategies in corporations from Balearic Islands and Castile-La Mancha are mainly focused on the social field, developing lines of work based, in most of the cases, on partnerships with non-profit making organizations.

The 12 analysed Spanish broadcasters launched web sections named transparency portals, except from *Canal Extremadura* and *Radiotelevisión Canaria*. An in-depth analysis shows that these sections include information on policy frameworks and economic management, although there are differences between them.

The *Corporació Catalana de Mitjans Audiovisuals* from Catalonia has a transparency unit divided into six subsections: corporate information, activity, management, recruitment, employment information, control, and assessment. It is worth stressing that CSR is not included.

The CRTVG from Galicia and the EITB from the Basque country do include CSR in their transparency portals. The first one also includes institutional information, corporate activity, and users interaction in the same section. The second one adds five elements: planning and results, regulation, group presentation and organization, recruitment and content self-regulation.

The Murcian broadcaster also has a corporate section with transparency objectives, in which include information on contractor's profile, normative, annual statements; budgets, minor contracts and contracts, chart and staff; human resources, audiovisual sector, and funding in 2015. On the other hand, the *Corporación Aragonesa de Radio y Televisión* groups contents together into four major blocs: institutional, organisational, and political information; data on planning, management, control, funding, and budgets; information on contracts, agreements, and assignments; and, finally, contact, right of access, and other information.

The transparency unit from the Asturian Broadcaster provide users with documents on legislation, structure, organization chart, framework terms of reference, contract program, management, recruitment, employment information, and control and assessment.

The Balearic broadcaster has also a transparency portal with six sections: recruitment, collaboration agreements, economic and budget information, and relation of real estate properties, remunerations, and right of access. The corporation from Castile-La Mancha shows four elements: institutional and organizations information, economic and budgetary data, public service –in which CSR is included– and right to access information.

The transparency section from the Andalusian RTVA includes from institutional and organizational to documents on procedures, services charter, citizen participation, and relevant legal information. Also, it includes data on high positions, planning and assessment, agreements, and subsidies. In the same vein, *Telemadrid* presents a section divided into three subsections: institutional and organizational information, relevant legal information, and economic and budgetary data.

Among these five above-mentioned corporations, only three of them have global strategies. Also, it should be noted the way environment becomes a priority issue in performance reports. The following table shows the information contained in CSR reports from the CCMA -2013-, EITB -2013, 2014-, and CRTVG -2014-.

Table 2. Indicators of environmental performance in Spanish local broadcasters

INDICATOR OF ENVIRONMENTAL PERFORMANCE			
ENVIRONMENTAL PERFORMANCE	CCMA	EITB	CRTVG
Use of paper	✓	✓	X
Use of water	X	X	✓
Impact of ink and printing materials	✓	✓	X
Recycling policies	✓	✓	✓
Greenhouse gas emissions	X	✓	✓
Measures to be environmentally sound	✓	✓	X

Source: Prepared by the authors, 2016

- **Use of paper**

Corporations from Catalonia and the Basque country merely publish information on paper consumption in 2013 and 2014, respectively. In the case of CCMA, the amount reaches 22,920 kilos, while the EITB reaches 19,577 –lower than the figure of 20,130 in 2013. Further, it notes that 18,780 kilos of paper waste were produced –16,880 in 2013-, from which 95.9 per cent were recycled. The Basque EITB also mentions the launching of Zero Paper, an app for conducting processes without paper.

- **Use of water**

CRTVG is the only one that provides information on this issue, while it is not very precise. It reports on the application of water reduction systems, but there are no specific figures.

- **Impact of ink and printing materials**

The Catalan CCMA notes that the corporation used 300 kilos of toners in 2013, while the EITB employed 46.2 in 2014, five less than the previous year.

- **Recycling policies**

The CCMA reports that it sent 872 elements for recycling in 2014, and donated material to foundations, education centres, and NGOs –2.252 elements and 56 receivers in 2012-. Also, it expresses its commitment to recycle the rest of material (2012: 18.960 kilos of wood, 379 of cans, 837 of batteries, 20 of plastic, 129 of CD and DVD, 11.156 of electronic waste, and 2.550 of video tapes. The CRTVG focuses its activity on waste separation and disposal of obsolete equipment.

The EITB presents a list of results on its recycling policy between 2013 and 2014: a) electronic devices: 630 kilos in 2013 and 510 in 2014; b) fluorescent: 143 kilos in 2013 and 269 in 2014; c) batteries: 153 kilos in 2013 and 289 in 2014; d) sanitary waste: 9 kilos in 2013 and 13 in 2014; e) paper and cardboard: 16.880 kilos in 2013 and 18,880 in 2014; f) plastic: 800 in 2013 and 3,200 in 2014; g) toner: 52 kilos in 2013 and 46 in 2014; h) wood: 13,660 kilos in 2013 and 9,920 in 2014.

- **Greenhouse gas emissions**

The EITB reached a 14.2 per cent reduction of greenhouse gas emissions from 2012. Also, it emitted 4,103 CO₂ tons in 2014 –4,340 in 2013- and reached 10,026.952 kw/h of electrical consumption in 2013, higher than previous year –9,962.544 kw/h. Besides, EITB created an Audit Department on Energy Efficiency through which lights were changed and replaced by a new lighting installation; air

conditioning was improved; energy measurement systems were renewed; and automatic switching off computers at night was installed. On the other hand, the CRTVG refers to the renovation of fifteen cars of its fleet in order to comply with the European rule on polluting gases.

- **Measures to be environmentally sound**

This section includes all kind of actions aimed ultimately at reducing the impact on environment. In this regard, the action plan for was management and the manual of good environmental from the CCMA should be highlighted.

The EITB report includes the Mobility Plan and the renewal of the cars fleet for environmental reasons. Moreover, it notes that all public contracts should be based on environmental criteria. On the other hand, all environmental policies are certified by AENOR –Spanish Association for Standardization and Certification- rule ISO I400I.

The main measure introduced by CRTVG was the renovation of the cars fleet, purchasing 120 LED lights for its facilities.

6. Towards a new way of reporting

The research is based on the parameters proposed by the Global Reporting Initiative in its G3.1 Sustainability Reporting Guidelines; specifically the Media Sector Supplement. In the environmental section, it warns on the need to pay attention to: materials, energy, water, biodiversity, emissions, effluents and waste; products and services, compliance, transport, suppliers' environmental assessment, and grievance mechanisms on the environment. This is evidence of a tightening for companies of environmental performance's criteria.

When it comes to materials, the guide recommends indicating the weight, volume and percentage of recycled products, as well as reducing consumption and energy requirements for products and services. As regards water use, items highlighted include total water collection through various sources and percentage of recycled and reused water.

GRI intends to monitor biodiversity trough data from operating facilities; description of the most significant impacts; protected and restored habitats; and number of affected species because of operations. Also, it calls for data on direct and indirect greenhouse gas emissions, as well as their intensity and measures for reducing them.

Regarding wastes, core indicators include measuring total emissions by quality and destiny; total weight of waste and effluents; number and volume of discharges; weight of transported weight; identification, size, statues of biodiversity in water bodies; and habitats affected in any way by water spills resulting from corporate activities.

When talking about the products and services aspect, the GRI want companies to report on initiatives to mitigate environmental impacts and percentage of products sold and their packaging materials. Reporting on compliance should include monetary value of significant fines and total number of non-monetary sanctions for non-compliance with environmental laws and regulations. Then, it calls for data on significant environmental impacts of transporting products and other goods and materials.

The overall section is referred to total environmental protection expenditures and investments by types, while suppliers' environmental assessment is focused on the percentage of suppliers examining

environmental issues and negative impacts, both real and potential, on the supply chain. Grievance mechanisms refer to managed and resolved complaints.

7. Conclusions

While the European Union hardens environmental legislation, international initiatives like the Global Reporting Initiative looks into the requirements that corporations have to fulfil if they are to be responsible and environmentally friendly.

Although this work is based on public service companies, whose commitment itself is directly related to their public mission, they cannot escape from corporate social responsibility rules, since they need to regain credibility and reputation in the eyes of a citizenry that has lost faith in their public media.

Results obtained reach a main conclusion: public broadcasters in Europe and Spanish Autonomous regions with global CSR strategies are not strictly following the rigid parameters proposed by the Global Reporting Initiative.

In fact, the content analysis shows that the GRI indicators in which the nine broadcasters are most active are: 1) measures to be environmentally sound; 2) greenhouse gas emissions; 3) recycling policies. On the contrary, much less attention is given to the impact of ink and printing materials.

That means that public broadcasters are developing many actions, but there is a lack of detailed strategies. And also, those actions are included in content blocks with general and imprecise titles. In most of the cases, performance reports do not go beyond providing figures, leaving aside the real impact and procedure.

These results are not enough to evaluate environmental policies, since any public broadcaster report on a consistent strategy for reducing impacts. They are concrete short-term measures to provide one-off solutions.

This is why it was opened a second line of research on environmental policies. A public broadcaster should have specific strategies if they are to set up targets; to evaluate, correct and implement new actions based on the results.

This part of the study showed that the implementation of environmental policies is not widespread for the time being. The same applies for regional corporations in Spain, since only three out of 12 are working in this sense.

This article leads to the conclusion that, while there is some awareness of environmental matters on the part of European public broadcasters, there is a lack of a global strategy. Also, these nine organizations, which have implemented their strategies for corporate social responsibility as a self-regulation tool, represent less than half of the EU28.

Acknowledgments

The work is part of the R+D research project CSO2015-66543-P, belonging to the National Programme for Encouraging Excellent Scientific and Technical Research, national subprogram of knowledge creation from the Spanish Ministry of Economy and Competitiveness, entitled “Indicators related to broadcasters governance, funding, accountability, innovation, quality and public service applicable to Spain in the digital context”. Also, it is part of the Prometeo Program, which belongs to the National Secretary of High Education, Science, Technology, and Innovation (SENESCYT) of the Ecuadorian

government, and is developed at the Technical University of Loja and the Pontifical Catholic University of Ecuador –Ibarra headquarters-. Authors of this paper are also members of the International Research Network on Communication Management –XESCOM-.

References

AccountAbility (2005). *Stakeholder Engagement Standard*. London: AccountAbility.

Brundtland Commission (1987). *Our Common Future*. Oxford: Oxford University Press

Clarke, Th. (2014). “Ética, valores y gobiernocorporativo. La tomadecisionescomercialeses unejercicio moral”. BBVA OpenMind. <https://www.bbvaopenmind.com/articulo/etica-valores-y-gobierno-corporativo/?fullscreen=true>

IUCN, UNEP, WWF (1991). “Caring for the Earth. A Strategy for Sustainable Living”. <https://portals.iucn.org/library/efiles/edocs/CFE-003.pdf>

EBU (2015). “Public Service Media Contribution to Society Produced the Media Intelligence Service (MIS) of the European Broadcasting Union”. www.ebu.ch/mis

European Commission (2003). *Corporate Social Responsibility: A Business Contribution to Sustainable Development*. Brussels: European Union.

European Commission (2004). *Corporate Social Responsibility: National Public Policies in the European Union*. Bruselas: Unión Europea. European Commission (2009). *Review of the EU Sustainable Development Strategy (EU SDS)*. <http://ec.europa.eu/environment/eussd/>

Global Reporting Initiative, 2012. *Guía para la Elaboración de Memorias de Sostenibilidad y Suplemento Sectorial para Medios*. Retrieved from: <https://www.globalreporting.org/resource/library/Spanish-MSS.pdf>

Kennedy School of Government Corporate Responsibility Initiative (2004). *Leadership, Accountability and Partnership: Critical Trends and Issues in Corporate Social Responsibility*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University.

Le Galés, P. (2007): “Gobernanza y cohesión social”. En Congreso Regiones Capitales (Hall, P., dir.). Comunidad de Madrid, pp. 327-347

Moore, M. H. (1995). *Creating public value. Strategic management in government*. N. York: Harvard University Press

Muñoz, E. (2005). “Gobernanza, ciencia, tecnología y política: trayectoria y evolución”. *Revista Arbor*, CSIC, 715, pp. 287-300

Olsen, J. P. (2008). “EU Governance: Where do we go from here?”. Working Paper. University of Oslo. https://www.sv.uio.no/arena/english/research/publications/arena-publications/workingpapers/working-papers2008/wp08_10.pdf

PNUMA (2007). “Finance Initiative: Innovative Financing for Sustainability: The Working Capital Report 2007”. <http://www.unpri.org/twcr/>.

PNUMA Finance Initiative (2004). *The Materiality of Social, Environmental and Governance Issues to Equity Pricing*. Geneva: PNUMA.

PNUMA Finance Initiative (2005). *CEO Briefing on the Future of Climate Change Policy: The Financial Sector Perspective*. Geneva: PNUMA.

Porter, Michael E. and Mark R. Kramer (2011). "Creating sharing value". *Harvard Business Review*, January-February

Prats, J., (2005). *De la burocracia al management. Del management a la gobernanza. Las transformaciones de las Administraciones Públicas de nuestro tiempo*. Madrid: INAP

Solomon, R. C. (1992). "Corporate Roles, Personal Virtues: An Aristotelean Approach to Business Ethics", *Business Ethics Quarterly* 2 (3), 317-339.

Stohl, Cynthia; Stohl, Michael; Popova, Lucy (2009). "A New Generation of Corporate Codes of Ethics". *Journal of Business Ethics*, vol. 90, n. 4, pp. 607-622

SustainAbility (2011). "Global Economic Recovery and Sustainability Survey". London: SustainAbility

World Business Council for Sustainable Development (2002). *Corporate Social Responsibility: The WBCSD's Journey*, WBCSD.

World Business Council for Sustainable Development (2011). *Global Corporate Citizenship Initiative: Redefining the Future of Growth: The New Sustainability Champions*. Geneva: International Labour Office.